

Advertise your small business on nytimes.com. Introducing Self-Service Advertising on NYTimes.com. An easy and affordable way to create your own online ads. Get Started »

U.S. Tries to Make It Easier to Wiretap the Internet

By CHARLIE SAVAGE
Published: September 27, 2010

WASHINGTON — Federal law enforcement and national security officials are preparing to seek sweeping new regulations for the Internet, arguing that their ability to wiretap criminal and terrorism suspects is “going dark” as people increasingly communicate online instead of by telephone.

Multimedia

Political Points Podcast

Readers' Comments

Readers shared their thoughts on this article.

[Read All Comments \(537\) »](#)

Essentially, officials want Congress to require all services that enable communications — including encrypted e-mail transmitters like BlackBerry, social networking Web sites like [Facebook](#) and software that allows direct “peer to peer” messaging like [Skype](#) — to be technically capable of complying if served with a wiretap order. The mandate would include being able to intercept and unscramble encrypted messages.

The bill, which the Obama administration plans to submit to lawmakers next year, raises fresh questions about how to balance security needs with protecting privacy and fostering innovation. And because security services around the world face the same problem, it could set an example that is copied globally.

[James X. Dempsey](#), vice president of the Center for Democracy and Technology, an Internet policy group, said the proposal had “huge implications” and challenged “fundamental elements of the Internet revolution” — including its decentralized design.

“They are really asking for the authority to redesign services that take advantage of the unique, and now pervasive, architecture of the Internet,” he said. “They basically want to turn back the clock and make Internet services function the way that the telephone system used to function.”

But law enforcement officials contend that imposing such a mandate is reasonable and necessary to prevent the erosion of their investigative powers.

“We’re talking about lawfully authorized intercepts,” said [Valerie E. Caproni](#), general counsel for the [Federal Bureau of Investigation](#). “We’re not talking expanding authority. We’re talking about preserving our ability to execute our existing authority in order to protect the public safety and national security.”

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

COMMENTS (537)

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

SINGLE PAGE

REPRINTS

SHARE



Log in to see what your friends are sharing on nytimes.com. Privacy Policy | What's This? [Log In With Facebook](#)

What's Popular Now

The BP-Spill Baby-Turtle Brigade



California Reduces Its Penalty for Marijuana



Ads by Google what's this?

FBI - Intelligence Degree
Online Intelligence Studies Degree from American Public University.
[www.StudyatAPU.com/HomelandSecurity](#)

Cell Phone Spying
Spy on Text Messages & Phone Calls Undetectable!
Works with all Phones
[www.TheCellSnoop.com](#)

DVR Surveillance Systems
Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save!
[Surveillance.BuyerZone.com](#)

CCTV Installation
Protect Your Assets. Install CCTV Today by Security Pro Installers.
[www.ParagonLocksmith.com](#)

College for FBI
Earn an intelligence degree online. Respected. Affordable. Accredited.
[www.apus.edu/intelligence](#)

Covert GPS Tracking
Track Any Vehicle, Person or Asset With A \$199 GPS Tracking System!
[BrickHouseSecurity.com/GPS-Tracking](#)

Advertise on NYTimes.com

Great Getaways - Travel Deals by E-Mail

Sign up for travel offers from NYTimes.com's premier advertisers.



Sign Up

[See Sample](#) | [Privacy Policy](#)

MOST POPULAR

E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED VIEWED

- 1. Making Math Lessons as Easy as 1, Pause, 2, Pause ...

Investigators have been concerned for years that changing communications technology could damage their ability to conduct surveillance. In recent months, officials from the F.B.I., the Justice Department, the [National Security Agency](#), the White House and other agencies have been meeting to develop a proposed solution.

There is not yet agreement on important elements, like how to word statutory language defining who counts as a communications service provider, according to several officials familiar with the deliberations.

But they want it to apply broadly, including to companies that operate from servers abroad, like Research in Motion, the Canadian maker of BlackBerry devices. In recent months, that company has [come into conflict](#) with the governments of Dubai and India over their inability to conduct surveillance of messages sent via its encrypted service.

In the United States, phone and broadband networks are already required to have interception capabilities, under a 1994 law called the [Communications Assistance to Law Enforcement Act](#). It aimed to ensure that government surveillance abilities would remain intact during the evolution from a copper-wire phone system to digital networks and cellphones.

Often, [?](#)estigators can intercept communications at a switch operated by the network company. But sometimes — like when the target uses a service that encrypts messages between his computer and its servers — they must instead serve the order on a service provider to get unscrambled versions.

Like phone companies, communication service providers are subject to wiretap orders. But the 1994 law does not apply to them. While some maintain interception capacities, others wait until they are served with orders to try to develop them.

The F.B.I.'s operational technologies division spent \$9.75 million last year helping communication companies — including some subject to the 1994 law that had difficulties — do so. And its [2010 budget](#) included \$9 million for a “Going Dark Program” to bolster its electronic surveillance capabilities.

Beyond such costs, Ms. Caproni said, F.B.I. efforts to help retrofit services have a major shortcoming: the process can delay their ability to wiretap a suspect for months.

Moreover, some services encrypt messages between users, so that even the provider cannot unscramble them.

There is no public data about how often court-approved surveillance is frustrated because of a service's technical design.

But as an example, one official said, an investigation into a drug cartel earlier this year was stymied because smugglers used peer-to-peer software, which is difficult to intercept because it is not routed through a central hub. Agents eventually installed surveillance equipment in a suspect's office, but that tactic was “risky,” the official said, and the delay “prevented the interception of pertinent communications.”

Moreover, according to several other officials, after the failed Times Square bombing in May, investigators discovered that the suspect, [Faisal Shahzad](#), had been communicating with a service that lacked prebuilt interception capacity. If he had aroused suspicion beforehand, there would have been a delay before he could have been wiretapped.

To counter such problems, officials are coalescing around several of the proposal's likely requirements:

¶ Communications services that encrypt messages must have a way to unscramble them.

2. [Pogue's Posts: Line2: Turn an iPod Touch into an iPhone](#)
3. [Foreclosures Slow as Document Flaws Emerge](#)
4. [Line by Line: Hatching the Pot](#)
5. [Really?: The Claim: Gargling With Salt Water Can Ease Cold Symptoms](#)
6. [State of the Art: A Simple Swipe on a Phone, and You're Paid](#)
7. [Paul Krugman: Taking On China](#)
8. [Op-Ed Contributor: Elite Colleges, or Colleges for the Elite?](#)
9. [David Brooks: The Austerity Caucus](#)
10. [Birth Pangs](#)

[Go to Complete List »](#)

ADVERTISEMENTS

Find your dream home with
The New York Times Real Estate



[Follow The New York Times on Twitter](#)

[Watch today's top videos](#)

[See the news in the making. Watch TimesCast, a daily news video.](#)

Some Promise You the World. We Deliver.
Save 50% on home delivery. Click now. >

¶ Foreign-based providers that do business inside the United States must install a domestic office capable of performing intercepts.

¶ Developers of software that enables peer-to-peer communication must redesign their service to allow interception.

A version of this article appeared in print on September 27, 2010, on page A1 of the New York edition.

Get the full newspaper experience, and more, delivered to your Mac or PC. Times Reader 2.0: Try it FREE for 2 full weeks.

COMMENTS

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

SINGLE PAGE

REPRINTS

Ads by Google

[what's this?](#)

DVR Surveillance Systems

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save!
Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

Related Searches

* Surveillance of Citizens by Government

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

* Computers and the Internet

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

* Wiretapping and Other Eavesdropping Devices and Methods

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

* Law and Legislation

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



BUSINESS »



Patents Ending, Eli Lilly Chases New Drugs

MOVIES »



Movie Review | [Let Me In](#)

OPINION »

Cyberbullying and a Student Suicide

A Room for Debate forum on whether the death of a Rutgers student argues for tougher laws against malicious acts online.

MOVIES »



Movie Review | [Freakonomics](#)

OPINION »



Line by Line: [Hatching the Pot](#)

WORLD »



For Some Germans, Unity Is Still a Work in Progress



Ask CALEA Communications Assistance for Law Enforcement Act

- [Home](#)
- [About](#)
- [The Law](#)
- [LEF](#)
- [Industry](#)
- [Archives](#)

Search:

TITLE I

- [Section 101](#)
- [Section 102](#)
- [Section 103](#)
- [Section 104](#)
- [Section 105](#)
- [Section 106](#)
- [Section 107](#)
- [Section 108](#)
- [Section 109](#)
- [Section 110](#)
- [Section 111](#)
- [Section 112](#)

TITLE II

- [Section 201](#)
- [Section 202](#)
- [Section 203](#)
- [Section 204](#)
- [Section 205](#)
- [Section 206](#)
- [Section 207](#)
- [Section 208](#)

Communications Assistance for Law Enforcement Act of 1994 (CALEA)

In October 1994, Congress took action to protect public safety and national security by enacting CALEA. The law further defines the existing statutory obligation of telecommunications carriers to assist law enforcement in executing electronic surveillance pursuant to court order or other lawful authorization. CALEA is codified at [47 U.S.C. § § 1001-1021](#).

The legislative history of CALEA is provided in [House Report No. 103-827, Part I](#).

◀ Please use the menu on the left to select the section you wish to see. You can download the complete act in PDF or Word format from the bottom of this menu.

Last Updated: August 27, 2009

Recommend

HOME PAGE TODAY'S PAPER VIDEO MOST POPULAR TIMES TOPICS

Subscribe to The Times | Log In | Register Now | Help | TimesPeople

The New York Times

U.S.

Search All NYTimes.com

Go



WORLD U.S. N.Y. / REGION BUSINESS TECHNOLOGY SCIENCE HEALTH SPORTS OPINION ARTS STYLE TRAVEL JOBS REAL ESTATE AUTOS POLITICS EDUCATION BAY AREA CHICAGO

Advertise your small business on nytimes.com

Introducing Self-Service Advertising on NYTimes.com. An easy and affordable way to create your own online ads.

Get Started »

Advertise on NYTimes.com

U.S. Tries to Make It Easier to Wiretap the Internet

Published: September 27, 2010

(Page 2 of 2)

Providers that failed to comply would face fines or some other penalty. But the proposal is likely to direct companies to come up with their own way to meet the mandates. Writing any statute in “technologically neutral” terms would also help prevent it from becoming obsolete, officials said.

Multimedia

Political Points Podcast

Political Points Podcast

Readers' Comments

Readers shared their thoughts on this article.

[Read All Comments \(537\) »](#)

Even with such a law, some gaps could remain. It is not clear how it could compel compliance by overseas services that do no domestic business, or from a “freeware” application developed by volunteers.

In their battle with Research in Motion, countries like Dubai have sought leverage by threatening to block BlackBerry data from their networks. But Ms. Caproni said the F.B.I. did not support filtering the Internet in the United States.

Still, even a proposal that consists only of a legal mandate is likely to be controversial, said [Michael A. Sussmann](#), a former Justice Department lawyer who advises communications providers.

“It would be an enormous change for newly covered companies,” he said. “Implementation would be a huge technology and security headache, and the investigative burden and costs will shift to providers.”

Several privacy and technology advocates argued that requiring interception capabilities would create holes that would inevitably be exploited by hackers.

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

COMMENTS (537)

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

SINGLE PAGE

REPRINTS

SHARE



Log in to see what your friends are sharing on nytimes.com. [Privacy Policy](#) | [What's This?](#)

Log In With Facebook

What's Popular Now

[The BP-Spill Baby-Turtle Brigade](#)



[California Reduces Its Penalty for Marijuana](#)



Ads by Google

what's this?

[FBI - Intelligence Degree](#)

Online Intelligence Studies Degree from American Public University. www.StudyatAPU.com/HomelandSecurity

[Thomas Jefferson Law](#)

Earn an Accredited Master of Laws at Thomas Jefferson Law School. MastersinLaw.TJSL.edu

[Cell Phone Spying](#)

Spy on Text Messages & Phone Calls Undetectable! Works with all Phones www.TheCellSnoop.com

[DVR Surveillance Systems](#)

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save! Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

[Surveillance Camera Install](#)

Keep your eyes open, Install CCTV Today by Security Pro Installers. www.ParagonLocksmith.com

[FBI College](#)

Accredited online university. Earn a degree in intelligence. Apply now www.APUS.edu/Intelligence

Ads by Google

what's this?

[FBI - Intelligence Degree](#)

Online Intelligence Studies Degree from American Public University.

Steven M. Bellovin, a [Columbia University](#) computer science professor, pointed to an [episode in Greece](#): In 2005, it was discovered that hackers had taken advantage of a legally mandated wiretap function to spy on top officials' phones, including the prime minister's.

"I think it's a disaster waiting to happen," he said. "If they start building in all these back doors, they will be exploited."

Susan Landau, a Radcliffe Institute of Advanced Study fellow and former Sun Microsystems engineer, argued that the proposal would raise costly impediments to innovation by small startups.

"Every engineer who is developing the wiretap system is an engineer who is not building in greater security, more features, or getting the product out faster," she said.

Moreover, providers of services featuring user-to-user encryption are likely to object to watering it down. Similarly, in the late 1990s, encryption makers fought off a proposal to require them to include a back door enabling wiretapping, arguing it would cripple their products in the global market.

But law enforcement officials rejected such arguments. They said including an interception capability from the start was less likely to inadvertently create security holes than retrofitting it after receiving a wiretap order.

They also noted that critics predicted that the 1994 law would impede cellphone innovation, but that technology continued to improve. And their envisioned decryption mandate is modest, they contended, because service providers — not the government — would hold the key.

"No one should be promising their customers that they will thumb their nose at a U.S. court order," Ms. Caproni said. "They can promise strong encryption. They just need to figure out how they can provide us plain text."

A version of this article appeared in print on September 27, 2010, on page A1 of the New York edition.

Get the full newspaper experience, and more, delivered to your Mac or PC. Times Reader 2.0: Try it FREE for 2 full weeks.

COMMENTS

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

SINGLE PAGE

REPRINTS

Ads by Google what's this?

DVR Surveillance Systems

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save!

Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

Related Searches

- * Surveillance of Citizens by Government [+ Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- * Computers and the Internet [+ Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- * Wiretapping and Other Eavesdropping Devices and Methods [+ Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- * Law and Legislation [+ Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

www.StudyatAPU.com/HomelandSecurity

Thomas Jefferson Law

Earn an Accredited Master of Laws at Thomas Jefferson Law School.
MastersinLaw.TJSL.edu

Cell Phone Spying

Spy on Text Messages & Phone Calls Undetectable!
Works with all Phones
www.TheCellSnoop.com

DVR Surveillance Systems

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save!
Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

Surveillance Camera Install

Keep your eyes open, Install CCTV Today by Security Pro Installers.
www.ParagonLocksmith.com

FBI College

Accredited online university. Earn a degree in intelligence. Apply now
www.APUS.edu/Intelligence

Ads by Google what's this?

FBI - Intelligence Degree

Online Intelligence Studies Degree from American Public University.
www.StudyatAPU.com/HomelandSecurity

Cell Phone Spying

Spy on Text Messages & Phone Calls Undetectable!
Works with all Phones
www.TheCellSnoop.com

DVR Surveillance Systems

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices, Features & Save!
Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

CCTV Installation

Protect Your Assets. Install CCTV Today by Security Pro Installers.
www.ParagonLocksmith.com

FBI - Intelligence

Earn an intelligence degree online at American Military University.
www.apus.edu/intelligence

Become An FBI Agent

Expand Your Job Opportunities With An Online Degree. Get Info.
www.CriminalJustice-Info.com

Advertise on NYTimes.com

Get the Opinion Today E-Mail

Sign up for the highlights of the day in Opinion, sent weekday afternoons.

[Sign Up](#)

[See Sample](#) | [Privacy Policy](#)

MOST POPULAR

- E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED VIEWED
1. Making Math Lessons as Easy as 1, Pause, 2, Pause ...
 2. Pogue's Posts: Line2: Turn an iPod Touch into an iPhone
 3. Foreclosures Slow as Document Flaws Emerge
 4. Line by Line: Hatching the Pot
 5. Really?: The Claim: Gargling With Salt Water Can Ease Cold Symptoms
 6. State of the Art: A Simple Swipe on a Phone, and

You're Paid

- 7. TARP Bailout to Cost Less Than Once Anticipated
- 8. Paul Krugman: Taking On China
- 9. David Brooks: The Austerity Caucus
- 10. Op-Ed Contributor: Elite Colleges, or Colleges for the Elite?

[Go to Complete List »](#)



Star Wars coming in 3-D

ALSO IN MOVIES »

- [New York Film Festival revives its offerings](#)
- [Connect with Movies on Facebook](#)

nytimes.com

MOVIES

ADVERTISEMENTS

Find your dream home with
 The New York Times Real Estate



[Follow The New York Times on Twitter](#)

The new issue of T is here

See the news in the making. Watch
 TimesCast, a daily news video.

The New York Times Store
 Rare and Newsworthy Items

Ads by Google

[what's this?](#)

DVR Surveillance Systems

Free Quotes - Multiple Dealers Compare Prices,
 Features & Save!

Surveillance.BuyerZone.com

INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



[BUSINESS »](#)

[MOVIES »](#)

[OPINION »](#)

[MOVIES »](#)

[OPINION »](#)

[WORLD »](#)

Cyberbullying and a Student Suicide

A Room for Debate
 forum on whether the
 death of a Rutgers



Patents Ending, Eli Lilly Chases New Drugs



Movie Review | Let Me In

student argues for tougher laws against malicious acts online.



Movie Review | Freakonomics



Line by Line: Hatching the Pot



For Some Germans, Unity Is Still a Work in Progress

[Home](#) | [World](#) | [U.S.](#) | [N.Y. / Region](#) | [Business](#) | [Technology](#) | [Science](#) | [Health](#) | [Sports](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Arts](#) | [Style](#) | [Travel](#) | [Jobs](#) | [Real Estate](#) | [Autos](#) | [Back to Top](#)

[Copyright 2010 The New York Times Company](#) | [Privacy](#) | [Terms of Service](#) | [Search](#) | [Corrections](#) |  [RSS](#) | [First Look](#) | [Help](#) | [Contact Us](#) | [Work for Us](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Site Map](#)